

[counsel on signature page]

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

Paul Tremblay,  
Individual and Representative Plaintiff,  
v.  
OpenAI, Inc., et al.,  
Defendants.

**Case No. 3:23-cv-03223-AMO**

**STIPULATION AND ~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER  
CONSOLIDATING CASES**

Judge: Araceli Martinez-Olguin  
Complaint Filed: June 28, 2023  
Trial Date: n/a

Sarah Silverman, et al.,  
Individual and Representative Plaintiffs,  
v.  
OpenAI, Inc., et al.,  
Defendants.

**Case No. 4:23-cv-03416-AMO**

**RELATED CASE**

Judge: Araceli Martinez-Olguin  
Complaint Filed: July 7, 2023  
Trial Date: n/a

Michael Chabon, et al.,  
Individual and Representative Plaintiffs,  
v.  
OpenAI, Inc., et al.,  
Defendants.

**Case No. 4:23-cv-04625-AMO**

**RELATED CASE**

Judge: Araceli Martinez-Olguin  
Complaint Filed: Sept. 8, 2023  
Trial Date: n/a

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 42(a) and Local Rule 3-12(a), Plaintiffs Paul Tremblay, Sarah Silverman, Christopher Golden, Richard Kadrey, Michael Chabon, Ta-Nehisi Coates, Junot Diaz, Andrew Sean Greer, David Henry Hwang, Matthew Klam, Laura Lippman, Rachel Louise Snyder, Ayelet Waldman, and Jacqueline Woodson and Defendants OpenAI, Inc.; OpenAI, L.P.; OpenAI OpCo, L.L.C.; OpenAI GP, L.L.C.; OpenAI Startup Fund GP I, L.L.C.; OpenAI Startup Fund I, L.P.; and OpenAI Startup Fund Management, LLC jointly request that the above-captioned actions (the “Actions”) be related and consolidated for all pretrial and trial proceedings. The parties, by and through their undersigned counsel, stipulate as follows:

WHEREAS, on June 28, 2023, Plaintiff Paul Tremblay<sup>1</sup> filed a Complaint (ECF No. 1) against Defendants OpenAI, Inc.; OpenAI, L.P.; OpenAI OpCo, L.L.C.; OpenAI GP, L.L.C.; OpenAI Startup Fund GP I, L.L.C.; OpenAI Startup Fund I, L.P.; and OpenAI Startup Fund Management, LLC<sup>2</sup> in *Tremblay, et al. v. OpenAI, Inc., et al.*, No. 3:23-cv-03223-AMO (N.D. Cal. June 28, 2023) (the “*Tremblay* Action”);

WHEREAS, on July 7, 2023, Plaintiffs Sarah Silverman, Christopher Golden, and Richard Kadrey<sup>3</sup> filed a Complaint (ECF No. 1) against Defendants in *Silverman, et al v. OpenAI, Inc, et al.*, No. 4:23-cv-03416-AMO (N.D. Cal. July 7, 2023) (the “*Silverman* Action”);

WHEREAS, on July 19, 2023, Plaintiffs filed an Administrative Motion to Consider Whether Cases Should Be Related regarding the *Tremblay* Action and *Silverman* Action (*Tremblay* Action, ECF No. 16);

WHEREAS, on July 28, 2023, this Court granted the motion and ordered the Clerk to relate the later-filed *Silverman* Action to the *Tremblay* Action (*Tremblay* Action, ECF No. 26);

WHEREAS, on September 8, 2023, Plaintiffs Michael Chabon, David Henry Hwang, Matthew

---

<sup>1</sup> On August 11, 2023, a former Plaintiff in this action—Mona Awad—voluntarily dismissed her individual claims and exited the case. ECF No. 29.

<sup>2</sup> OpenAI, Inc.; OpenAI, L.P.; OpenAI GP, L.L.C.; OpenAI OpCo, LLC; OpenAI Startup Fund GP I, L.L.C.; OpenAI Startup Fund I, L.P.; and OpenAI Startup Fund Management, LLC are collectively referred to as “OpenAI” or “Defendants.”

<sup>3</sup> Plaintiffs Paul Tremblay, Sarah Silverman, Christopher Golden, and Richard Kadrey are collectively referred to as “Plaintiffs.”

1 Klam, Rachel Louise Snyder, and Ayelet Waldman filed a Complaint against Defendants in *Chabon, et*  
2 *al. v. OpenAI, Inc, et al.*, Case No. 4:23-cv-04625-PHK (N.D. Cal. Sept. 8, 2023) (“*Chabon Action*”);

3 WHEREAS, on September 20, 2023, Plaintiffs filed an Administrative Motion to Consider  
4 Whether Cases Should Be Related seeking to relate the *Chabon Action* to the *Tremblay Action* (ECF  
5 No. 46);

6 WHEREAS, on October 5, 2023, an amended complaint was filed in the *Chabon Action* (ECF  
7 No. 11);

8 WHEREAS, on October 10, 2023, this Court granted the motion and ordered the Clerk to  
9 relate the *Chabon Action* to the *Tremblay Action* (*Tremblay Action*, ECF No. 53; *Chabon Action*, ECF  
10 No. 17);

11 WHEREAS, the *Tremblay Action*, the *Silverman Action*, and the *Chabon Action* (collectively,  
12 the “Related Actions”) all bring putative class action claims regarding ChatGPT and allege the same  
13 causes of action against the same Defendants;

14 WHEREAS, the parties agree that consolidation of the Actions will advance the just and  
15 efficient progress of this litigation, reduce case duplication, conserve Court time and resources, avoid  
16 the need to contact parties and witnesses for multiple proceedings, and minimize the expenditure of  
17 time and money for all parties involved. *See* Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a);

18 WHEREAS, by stipulating to consolidation of the Related Actions, Defendants do not concede  
19 the truth of any of Plaintiffs’ allegations or that certification of the putative classes is proper under  
20 Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23 and specifically reserves its right to oppose class certification on  
21 all available grounds;

22 WHEREAS, the parties have met and conferred and agreed to the terms of the [Proposed]  
23 Pretrial Order No. 1 filed herewith;

24 **NOW THEREFORE**, the parties, through their undersigned counsel, hereby stipulate and  
25 agree that, subject to the approval of the Court:

26 1. The *Tremblay Action*, the *Silverman Action*, and the *Chabon Action* shall be  
27 consolidated for all purposes under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 42(a);  
28

2. Following the ruling on Defendants' Motions to Dismiss (*Tremblay* Action, ECF No. 33; *Silverman* Action, ECF No. 32), Plaintiffs will file a consolidated complaint, **by March 13, 2024. See ECF 104.**

3. The *Chabon* Action shall be stayed pending consolidation. Defendants need not respond to the *Chabon* Complaint until Plaintiffs have filed a consolidated complaint.

4. The Court shall enter the ~~[Proposed]~~ Pretrial Order No. 1 filed herewith.

**IT IS SO STIPULATED.**

Dated: October 26, 2023

By: /s/ Joseph R. Saveri  
Joseph R. Saveri

Joseph R. Saveri (State Bar No. 130064)  
Cadio Zirpoli (State Bar No. 179108)  
Christopher K.L. Young (State Bar No. 318371)  
Kathleen J. McMahon (State Bar No. 340007)  
**JOSEPH SAVERI LAW FIRM, LLP**  
601 California Street, Suite 1000  
San Francisco, California 94108  
Telephone: (415) 500-6800  
Facsimile: (415) 395-9940  
Email: jsaveri@saverilawfirm.com  
czirpoli@saverilawfirm.com  
cyoung@saverilawfirm.com  
kcmahon@saverilawfirm.com

Matthew Butterick (State Bar No. 250953)  
1920 Hillhurst Avenue, #406  
Los Angeles, CA 90027  
Telephone: (323) 968-2632  
Facsimile: (415) 395-9940  
Email: mb@buttericklaw.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class in the  
Tremblay and Silverman Actions*

1 Dated: October 26, 2023

By: /s/ Daniel J. Muller  
Daniel J. Muller

3 Daniel J. Muller (State Bar No. 193396)  
4 **VENTURA HERSEY & MULLER, LLP**  
1506 Hamilton Avenue  
5 San Jose, California 95125  
Telephone: (408) 512-3022  
6 Facsimile: (408) 512-3023  
7 Email: dmuller@venturahersey.com

8 /s/ Bryan L. Clobes  
9 Bryan L. Clobes (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
10 **CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER**  
11 **& SPRENGEL LLP**  
205 N. Monroe Street  
12 Media, PA 19063  
Telephone: (215) 864-2800  
bclobes@caffertyclobes.com

13 Alexander J. Sweatman (*pro hac vice anticipated*)  
14 **CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER**  
15 **& SPRENGEL LLP**  
135 South LaSalle Street, Suite 3210  
16 Chicago, IL 60603  
Telephone: (312) 782-4880  
17 asweatman@caffertyclobes.com

18 *Counsel for Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class in the*  
19 *Chabon Action*

1 Dated: October 26, 2023


By: Joseph C. Gratz  
Joseph C. Gratz

3 Joseph C. Gratz (State Bar No. 240676)  
4 **MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP**  
425 Market Street  
5 San Francisco, CA 94105  
Telephone: 415-268-7000  
6 Facsimile: 415-268-7522  
Email: jgratz@mofo.com

8 *Counsel for OpenAI, Inc.; OpenAI, L.P.; OpenAI GP,*  
9 *L.L.C.; OpenAI OpCo, LLC; OpenAI Startup Fund GP*  
10 *I, L.L.C.; OpenAI Startup Fund I, L.P.; and OpenAI*  
11 *Startup Fund Management, LLC*

12 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

13  
14 Dated: February 16, 2024

15   
Honorable Araceli Martínez-Olguín  
United States Judge